

**DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION  
MINUTES  
Coeur d'Alene Library Community Room (lower level)  
THURSDAY, MARCH 28, 2024  
2:00 pm**

**COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:**

Skip Priest  
Michael Pereira  
Jon Ingalls (Vice-chair)  
Jef Lemmon  
Tom Messina (Chairman)  
Greta Snodgrass

**STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT:**

Hilary Patterson, Community Planning Director  
Tami Stroud, Associate Planner  
Traci Clark, Admin. Assistant

**CALL TO ORDER:**

The meeting was called to order by Chairman Messina at 2:00 p.m.

**MINUTES: \*\*\*ITEMS BELOW ARE CONSIDERED TO BE ACTION ITEMS**

Motion by Commissioner Pereira, seconded by Commissioner Snodgrass, to approve the minutes of the Design Review Commission meeting on January 25, 2024. Motion Carried.

**COMMISSION COMMENTS:**

None.

**STAFF COMMENTS:**

None.

**PUBLIC COMMENTS:**

None.

**NEW BUSINESS: \*\*\*ITEMS BELOW ARE CONSIDERED TO BE ACTION ITEMS**

Owner: Hagadone Hospitality Co.

Applicant: Cory Trapp, Architect, LTA Architects

Location: 101 and 123 E. Sherman Avenue and properties north of the alley and south of Lakeside Avenue between First and Second Streets legally described as CDA & KINGS ADD including 75.9 feet of Tax#1646, Tax#1686, Tax#4556 Reserve Block, Lots 2 and 3, west 35 feet of Lot 4, and Tax#4557 Block Y, totaling 50,442 SF

Request: Hagadone Hospitality Co. is proposing to build a fifteen (15) story hotel, a restaurant and three (3) story parking garage, with one (1) story underground and two (2) floors above ground for guest parking. The subject property is in the Downtown Core (DC) zoning district, and requires Design Review Commission approval. (DR-2-24)

Ms. Stroud provided the following statements:

This is a request for the First Meeting with the Design Review Commission for a proposed 15-story 139 room hotel, to include 3,775 SF of retail/office space, a 6,000 SF restaurant and a detached 3-level parking structure (DR-2-24).

The property is a 50,442 SF parcel located at 101 and 123 E. Sherman Avenue and properties North of the alley and South of Lakeside Avenue between First and Second Streets in the Downtown Core (DC) zoning District. The project site is comprised of several lots totaling 50,442. S.F. along Sherman Avenue between 1st and 2nd Streets, a lot on the southeast corner of First Street and Lakeside Avenue, and a small lot on the north side of the alley near Second Street. An existing three-story office building and a two-story restaurant will be demolished along Sherman Avenue to accommodate the construction of the new hotel and restaurant. The applicant is proposing a 15-story mixed use building with retail and hotel amenities on the first floor and 14 floors of guest suites with 139 guestrooms, a 6,000 S.F. restaurant and 3,775 S.F. of retail/office use. The main entrance to the hotel will be located on the corner of Sherman Avenue and Second Street, with a secondary entrance and covered drop off located on the alley side of the building. In addition, a three (3) level detached parking structure will be located behind the hotel and restaurant, on the corner of First Street and Lakeside Avenue. The parking structure will provide parking for the hotel and restaurant. One level of parking is below grade and two floors of parking will be above grade. The lower level of the parking structure will be accessed from the alley and the upper levels will be accessed from Lakeside Avenue. There are nine (9) existing parking spaces located on the east end of the alley that will provide additional parking and ADA parking for the hotel. The proposed restaurant, with a seasonal roof top bar, will be constructed on the corner of Sherman Avenue and First Street. The entrance for the restaurant will be located on First Street, with a secondary entrance and covered drop off located on the alley side of the building. Parking for hotel guests and the restaurant will be provided in the parking structure on the corner of First and Lakeside Avenue. There are also nine (9) additional parking spaces located on the east end of the alley that will provide ADA parking for the hotel guests. The total height of the building is 190' tall (168' plus 22' for architectural features) and is below the maximum height allowed in the Downtown Core (DC) which is 220' tall. The proposed project is located in the DC (Downtown Core) zoning district, and must adhere to the (DC) Downtown Core Design Guidelines and Standards.

A total of 109 parking spaces are proposed for the project. The DC code requires 90 parking spaces for the combined uses; 70 spaces are required for the hotel (Minimum 0.5/room to max 2.0/room), the office/retail use requires eight (8) spaces, and the restaurant use requires twelve (12) spaces. Additional parking is available in the existing parking structure at the Coeur d'Alene Resort, across the street to the south, if needed. Parking will also be available to staff on the north side of the parking garage at an existing surface lot on Lakeside Avenue between First and Second Streets.

Ms. Stroud said the Decision Point is should the Design Review Commission approve the design for the 15-story "Sherman Tower" hotel, restaurant and parking structure located at 101 and 123 E. Sherman Avenue and properties north of the alley and south of Lakeside Avenue between First and Second Streets in the Downtown Core (DC) zoning district either with or without conditions, or direct modifications to the project's design and require a second meeting?

The Design Review Commission (“DRC”) is tasked with reviewing the project to ensure compliance with all applicable design standards and guidelines. This project is located within the Downtown Core (DC) zoning district and located on a block that is designated as a vehicular-oriented street. The DRC will provide feedback to the applicant and staff on how the applicable design standards and guidelines affect and enhance the project. The DRC will provide direction to the applicant, and may suggest changes or recommendations to the proposed project. The DRC may render a decision during the First Meeting, or request an Optional Second Meeting.

All exterior projects south of the midblock of Lakeside/Coeur d’Alene, all street façade alterations, and all exterior expansions trigger review by the Design Review Commission if located in the Downtown Core (DC) zoning district. (Municipal Code § 17.09.320(A))

A development applicant shall participate in the design review process as required by this Article before substantive design decisions are fixed and difficult or expensive to alter. The City will work with the applicant in a collaborative fashion so that the goals of both the City and the applicant can be met to the greatest degree possible, and to address the concerns of neighbors and the community. In order for this process to work effectively, the applicant must be willing to consider options for the project’s basic form, orientation, massing, relationships to existing sites and structures, surrounding street and sidewalks, and appearance from a distance. (Municipal Code § 17.09.325)

The applicant has the obligation to prove that the project complies with the adopted design standards and guidelines, which serve as the basis for the design review. The design review commission may not substitute the adopted standards and guidelines with other criteria of its own choosing. Nor may it merely express individual, personal opinions about the project and its merits. Nevertheless, it may apply its collective judgment to determine how well a project comports with the standards and guidelines and may impose conditions to ensure better or more effective compliance. It also must be recognized that there will be site specific conditions that need to be addressed by the commission as it deliberates. The commission is authorized to give direction to an applicant to rectify aspects of the design to bring it more into compliance. The commission is authorized to approve, approve with conditions or deny a design following the Optional Second Meeting with the applicant. (Municipal Code § 17.03.330)

The Design Review Commission may grant or deny the application, or grant the application with such conditions as are, in its judgment, necessary to ensure conformity to the adopted standards and guidelines. The Commission shall make written findings to support its decision, specifically stating how the project conforms to the adopted design standards and guidelines or how it does not. A copy of the Commission's decision shall be mailed to the applicant and the Director shall make the commission's decision available for public inspection. The Commission has the power to table a decision to a later date and request an additional meeting. (Municipal Code § 17.03.335)

Ms. Stroud shared several photos of the subject property and surrounding properties.

#### **Downtown Design Guidelines:**

- **Gateways** are key intersections within and around the edges of downtown that require special treatment. The gateway for this project is the *Intersection of Sherman Avenue and Second Street*.
- **Pedestrian-Oriented Streets** are streets that are intended to have a lively, pedestrian friendly environment in the downtown. The pedestrian-oriented streets are: *Second Street between Sherman Ave. and Lakeside Avenue, and on Sherman Avenue from Second Street to Sixth Street*.

- **Vehicular-Oriented Streets** are streets that are intended to present a lively and inviting environment as vehicles drive through the downtown. The vehicular-oriented streets are: *Sherman Avenue from First Street to Second Street.*
- FAR Analysis:
  - Allowed FAR = 4.0 (201,768 SF)
  - Project FAR = 2.54 (127,990 SF)
- Height
  - Allowed = 200' (220' with bonuses)
  - Project height = 190'

### **Design Departure:**

The applicant has requested a design departure for Weather Protection related to the vertical dimension between the underside of the canopy or awning and the sidewalk. Per the DC design guidelines, the vertical dimension between the underside of the canopy or awning and the sidewalk shall be at least 8' and no more than 12'. Currently, the grade of Sherman Avenue slopes from Second Avenue to First Street and drops six (6) feet over the 300-foot street frontage. The proposed design has a canopy height starting at 9' above the sidewalk on the corner of Sherman and Second Street and has a clearance for pedestrian safety from the vertical canopy. In addition, a recessed entry to the hotel provides additional protection on the corner of Sherman Avenue and Second Street. As the sidewalk slopes down to the west, along Sherman Avenue, the canopy's vertical dimension will vary from 12' to 15'. As it follows the slope of the existing grade along Sherman Avenue, at the southwest corner of the project, it is 15'. Along First Street and Sherman Avenue, at the lowest grade, the canopy would have a vertical dimension of 18', which is 6' above the maximum allowable height. The requested design departure is to exceed a portion of the canopy to extend above the 12' maximum design guideline. The architect outlines the justification as the departure of the canopy height would still meet the weather protection requirement for pedestrians, the canopies are designed to follow the horizontal lines of the windows and floor line of proposed building.

This will not have any aesthetic or harmful effects to the city or adjacent properties. The canopies will have a solid roof with a metal framework structure that will be painted to match the bronze anodized window frames. Soffits will be clad with prefinished aluminum soffit panels with recessed can lights to provide pedestrian lighting. Due to the slope of the existing site and sidewalk, maintaining the horizontal lines of the building and windows is important to the design of the structure and the design departure will allow us to maintain the integrity of the design. The design departure request includes an exhibit showing how the canopy would look if it were to meet the guideline. The applicant has provided a justification for the requested Design Departure on pages 28 and 30 of the staff report.

Commissioner Ingalls asked Ms. Stroud about the design departure and if it was necessary because of the slope.

Ms. Stroud replied yes that is correct. The applicant will provide more details when he does his presentation.

Ms. Stroud continued her presentation and provided an overview of the Design Commission's role.

The DRC may provide input on the proposed design and shall identify any changes to the proposed project which are needed in order for the project to comply with the required design standards and guidelines. The DRC must determine, based on the information before it, whether the proposed project meets the applicable Downtown Design Guidelines. The DRC should identify the specific elements that meet or do not meet the guidelines in its Record of Decision.

### **Decision Point**

The DRC should grant the application in Item DR-2-24, a request by Cory Trapp, project architect with LTA Architects, on behalf of Hagadone Hospitality Co, for a multi-story hotel, to include retail/office space, a

restaurant and a detached 3 level parking structure located at 101 and 123 E. Sherman Avenue and parcels north of the alley and south of Lakeside Avenue between First and Second Streets, Coeur d'Alene, Idaho, be approved with or without conditions, or determine that the project would benefit from an additional DRC Meeting to review project changes in response to the first DRC Meeting or if it is deemed necessary based on all the circumstances.

### **Proposed Conditions Of Approval**

Planning:

1. The proposed design shall be substantially similar to those submitted with item DR-2-24.

Engineering:

2. Sidewalks along Sherman Avenue, First and Second Streets must be brought into ADA compliance.
3. Any existing driveway approaches not being used with the proposed development shall be removed.
4. The applicant shall complete a traffic study including a pedestrian safety study.
5. Pedestrian safety features recommended by the study and approved by the city shall be installed.

Ms. Stroud noted that the Engineering conditions are not part of the DRC's purview but are added by staff to ensure code compliance. She concluded her presentation.

### **Commission Discussion:**

Chairman Messina asked about the packet regarding page 49-52 which are the design guidelines for the Downtown Core and asked Ms. Stroud to confirm that these are the things that the Commission needs to look at as a Commission to make their decision, yes or no.

Ms. Stroud replied that is correct.

Chairman Messina asked when it says location of parking, that is the location of where the garage is, but it does not have anything to do with the number of parking spaces that are required. He asked staff to confirm that the Planning Department has reviewed the required parking with the applicant along with the height even though it is below the height requirement. He would just like to address the issues now for the public, in case they have any questions or comments.

Ms. Stroud answered that is correct on both questions. The commission needs to just focus on the Design Guidelines.

Chairman Messina opened the public hearing and swore in the applicant and the public as a group.

### **Applicant Testimony:**

John Barlow introduced himself as part of the development team. He stated he has been with the Hagadone Corporation Team for over 45 years and they have planned to expand the hotel at the right time and the right way. He feels like this is the perfect time and is being done the way Mr. Hagadone would have wanted it done. He explained why the Hagadone Corporation wants to build at this location. The land was purchased back in the early 1980's for the long-term planning of what the site could fulfill. During the last six years Coeur d'Alene has changed with business along with tourism. The resort model has always been business with some independent travel. The groups are a strong business, but free independent travel comes year-round and pays more money. When he had looked at a site over Front Avenue it was very convenient for a hotel operation. This facility being on its own allows them to build without interrupting the hotel operation and has enough site to laydown material. The design of this building is to take in to account the views and vistas to their neighbors to the north. The existing building that was formerly MoMo's restaurant will be removed and the new restaurant will be the same footprint and the same height. As you move East, it will stair step the building to allow views of the lake and the grounds of the resort from the people to the north. It makes the building more interesting than just a large Tower. They wanted to still have the red geraniums out front for the

people to enjoy on the corner. The restaurant will have a bar on the rooftop. They could have gone higher and wider but it just did not fit.

Cory Trapp, is the architect, introduced himself and stated that the site they are building on was the Desert Hotel and it had burned down in 1972. The drop off for the hotel will be through the alley and will be covered. The inspiration of the building is the Coeur d'Alene Resort Hotel. Now the intention of the design with the Sherman Tower is to keep it in design with the similar materials, finishes and appearance, with the use of copper, stucco and concrete. The base of the building will have a metal panel which was used on the Coeur d'Alene Press building. The Plaza Shops have some influence as well. The site drops from 2<sup>nd</sup> Street to 1<sup>st</sup> Street about seven feet. The intention in the design is the floor of the hotel and the restaurant is determined by 2<sup>nd</sup> Street. The entrance by 2<sup>nd</sup> Street floor will be level all the way over to the restaurant, which will put the floor to the restaurant about seven feet above the grade. This was done so the people sitting in the restaurant could see over the cars on Sherman and take advantage of the views of the lake and the city. The location of the parking will be off of Lakeside and the alley way. There will be a small elevator in the corner of the parking garage. There is a parking lot on 1<sup>st</sup> Street that the Hagadone Corporation owns and the employees will be parking there. If there is going to be an event, there will be Valet parking used at the existing Coeur d'Alene Resort parking garage.

Commissioner Ingalls commented that the number of spaces that will be provided are exceeding the number requirements, is that correct.

Mr. Trapp answered that is correct. There are 90 parking spaces required and they are building 109.

Commissioner Lemmon asked about the parking that is in between the building and the parking lot right now on Lakeside.

Mr. Trapp replied there is a shared parking agreement on the parking lot that is existing now. The agreement expires every 3 years, it will expire in 2025. The owner is aware of this and he will lose access to his parking.

Chairman Messina commented about the existing parking, regarding the nine spots and the drop off getting into the hotel. Will there be valet similar to the Coeur d'Alene Resort.

Mr. Trapp replied there will be a valet option. Talking with Mr. Reagan, about 30 to 40% of the people that will be coming to stay at the Resort do not drive a car. They go and get them and bring them to the hotel they are shuttled to and from the airport, golf course, etc.

Mr. Trapp continued with his presentation showing the landscaping, with the sconce lighting. There will be street trees along the parking structure. There will be screening on the parking structure and landscaping as well. There will be benches on the sidewalks, and there will be street trees along Sherman Avenue. The alley access will be one way from East to West.

Chairman Messina asked about the cars leaving the parking structure and asked which way they will they be turning. Mr. Trapp stated this is something that the City Engineer needs to address.

Mr. Trapp continued with his presentation. On the alley side there will be some pedestrian and car warning posts as an extra safety feature. The trash enclosure will be inside the building with a roll up door. The majority of all the lighting will be down lighting on all the balconies and underneath the canopies on the sidewalks. The corner of Sherman and 2<sup>nd</sup> Street will be a gateway, there will be some seasonal planters, tall windows and doors, and custom sconces very similar to the CDA Resort. The corner of 1<sup>st</sup> and Sherman will have the flowers and greenery and have it be a very pretty viewpoint for the people coming into the city. The maximum setbacks will be built right up to those setbacks. The restaurant cannot do that because at the corner, the city sidewalk is on Hagadone property, along with the traffic light and the control box. There is a 10-foot requirement off of Sherman, it is at 20 feet. The hotel from the second floor up can be straight because there is a curve around Sherman Avenue. The ground level details will have projecting sills, concrete plinth, columns, recessed window walls, canopies, stucco, and seasonal planters. There will be copper

parapet. There will be ground level windows and will have weather protection canopies. The restaurant will be full glass because of the views. The blank wall treatment is to use a lot of square lines to help break up the walls, along with windows and balconies. There will be a roof edge with copper detail. Signs will be integrated with the structure. The Hagadone Corp has a history of minimizing signage. The materials for the Tower will be concrete to look like stucco, all the windows will be white, with copper accents.

Mr. Trapp concluded his presentation.

Commissioner Lemmon asked how many rooms does the Coeur d'Alene Resort have and what is the height of the resort.

Mr. Barlow replied the height is 220 feet at the top of the peaks and there are 338 rooms at the Coeur d'Alene Resort.

Ms. Stroud commented that the One Lakeside condo building is 176 feet tall and the Thomas George building is 215 feet tall. These are both under the 220 feet height restriction.

Commissioner Ingalls commented to the public that would like to speak, the role of the commission is to use the 22 Coeur d'Alene Downtown Design Guidelines that the commission looks at. This is what we will be looking at, not if it's too high, or should have 400 parking spaces or what this will do to traffic. He knows there will be issues positive or negative. If you want to speak, please focus on the comments regarding these guidelines.

Adam Graves, introduced himself and said he is the president of the Downtown Association. He owns a business downtown and grew up in Coeur d'Alene. He is in support of this project and feels this will have a great impact on the Downtown businesses. This will have a huge financial boost to the economy throughout the year. There is always a push to have events in the off season to try and drive to keep the stores open. The rooftop restaurant will draw people as a destination from the surrounding areas to come and hang out, eat and shop. There will be more shops in the Tower which will have more members for the BID (Business Improvement District) that will fund keeping our sidewalks clean, more flower baskets. Everything that the Hagadone's have done has been done well and is top class. The Hagadone Corp and Mr. Reagan have always been great partners.

Brad Jordan introduced himself and said he has been involved in the Downtown for a lot of years. He was been involved in the 1980's during the revitalization on Sherman Avenue. He is glad that more trees are going to be put in. This will be a great addition to the Downtown. The buildings that will be coming down have no historical significance. If the Johnson building had any, it was lost in the 1960's. This will create a lot of jobs for the Downtown for the local people. The stair stepping of the design adds a lot of interesting architecture desirability to it. This is a very exciting time to have so much happening in Downtown. This building ties into the Resort but with a modern twist to it. This will help all the local business and restaurants all year round. He feels that Coeur d'Alene right now has the most redevelopment in the State of Idaho maybe, besides Boise. Most towns still have the original old buildings. He highly supports this project.

Bronwynn Blackman introduced herself and said she is with One Lakeside Hotel Condo. She is representing the owners. They are concerned about impacts on One Lakeside. They are concerned because the overflow of the condos parking, the people park in the parking lot on Lakeside and asked will that parking still be available for the public to park there. The other concern is the stair step of the building. They do appreciate it but the view from the east side from the residents who have views out the windows to Tubbs Hills will be obstructed.

Marie Widmeyer, introduced herself and said she has worked at the Resort for over 40 years, first as an employee and then as a business owner and renter for over 29 years. The Hagadone Corporation has always done things First class, from the landscaping to the cleanliness of the facility, as well has constant renovations and updating. She feels the building will be an asset to the Downtown and the community.

Luiz Garrigan introduced herself. Her concern is the traffic. This is a small town. This will cut off her view of Tubbs Hill.

Jill McElroy introduced herself. She said she is a resident of Coeur d'Alene North on the east end. Her views will be gone. She appreciates the design., But as a responsible tenant and owner of a condo, she feels she is losing what she bought. 100% of her lake view is gone with One Lakeside and now 100% of her view of Tubbs Hill will be gone as well. She asked that the applicant please take that into account when designing the back of the building.

Joe Arrotta, introduced himself. He asked if the building has changed since the first rendering in the Coeur d'Alene Press. He thought where the restaurant was, and then when its stair stepped was going to be wider.

#### **Applicant Rebuttal:**

Mr. Barlow stated that it is difficult to comment on views but this property had been owned since 1980. It is a valuable piece of land that needs to be its highest maximum use. He is proud that they accommodated the views even though they are not part of the Design Review process. The building that was in the Coeur d'Alene Press is the same foot print and steps it has just been more refined. The parking is needed for the Sherman Tower. Maybe under an arrangement there might some sort of parking for the public, similar to the existing parking structure where the public pays to park. But the first responsibility would be to accommodate the guests. They did start early on the traffic study; it is nearly complete. It actually shows that many traffic issues go down because retail leaving and people coming by air and staying in the hotel. When they come, guest do not get in their cars as often, they walk around town. This is being addressed as the City Engineer required.

Ms. Stroud presented the commission with the staff evaluation or facts. She stated staff is working with the applicant on the street tree requirements. Also, the total building signage Ms. Setters clarified the total is 915 sq feet 108 sq feet of that is for free standing signage which leaves 807 sq feet remaining for wall signage.

Public Testimony Closed.

#### **Commission Discussion:**

Commissioner Ingalls stated there is a lot in the packet. It is clear there is an out pouring of positive comments, and the level of care and stewardship of the Hagadone Corporation is well established. Mr. Brad Jordan mentioned the vibrancy of the Downtown and what this will bring. This brings great vision and bold gutsy investment. The Design Review aspect of it he commends staff and the applicant. They have addressed in detail. In his mind, this is very clear that all 22 guidelines have been met. He will approve the project without a second meeting.

Commissioner Lemmon stated the Hagadone Corporation came a couple of years earlier with the project over the shops. This project is way above and beyond the previous project. He commends this project. This is a great project. It fits into the Resort with consistent use of materials and he likes the setbacks and stair stepping. It's a great project. He thinks the project should move forward.

Commissioner Pereira stated it is a great looking project.

Chairman Messina agrees and is happy with any additional restaurants. He hears the public comments. The views have been taken away but this is what progress is sometimes. But they did minimize the obstruction of the view as best as they could. This is a financial risk to get this done as well.

Discussion Closed.

**Motion by Commissioner Ingalls, seconded by Commissioner Pereira, to approve Item DR-2-24  
Motion approved.**

**ROLL CALL:**

Commissioner Ingalls	Voted	Aye
Commissioner Lemmon	Voted	Aye
Commissioner Messina	Voted	Aye
Commissioner Pereira	Voted	Aye
Commissioner Snodgrass	Voted	Aye
Commissioner Priest	Voted	Aye

Motion to approve carried by 6 to a 0 vote.

**ADJOURNMENT**

Motion by Commissioner Lemmon, seconded by Commissioner Pereira, to adjourn the meeting.  
Motion carried.

The meeting was adjourned at 3:29 p.m.

Prepared by Traci Clark, Administrative Assistant